

Is the Khatm of Koonde for Imam Jafar Sadiq or Amir Muawiyah Exploring the Permissibility

Darulifta Ahlesunnat

(Dawateislami)

Question

What do the scholars of Islam say regarding the following matter: is the khatm of koonde carried out for Imam Ja‘far Ṣādiq رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ or Amīr Mu‘āwiyah رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ? Is it permissible to conduct such a khatm? Some people claim that Amīr Mu‘āwiyah رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ passed away on the 22nd of Rajab, not Imam Ja‘far Ṣādiق رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ, and carrying out such a khatm is the way of the misguided. Meaning they celebrate the passing of Amīr Mu‘āwiyah رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ by means of this. Therefore, we should avoid it lest we resemble them. However, it is mentioned in Sunni Behishti Zewar that it is permissible to conduct the khatm of koonde. Please give guidance as to what is correct.

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ

الْجَوَابُ بِعَوْنِ الْمَلِكِ الْوَهَّابِ اللَّهُمَّ هِدَايَةَ الْحَقِّ وَالصَّوَابِ

Muslims generally prepare food, etc., and recite Quran etc., on the 22nd of Rajab, in particular so that they can transmit its reward to Imam Ja‘far Ṣādiق رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ. This is known as *koonde*. This is totally permissible according to the shari‘ah. The erudite Ḥanafi jurist, Mufti Amjad ‘Ali A‘zami رَحِمَهُ اللهُ عَلَيْهِ states the following regarding *koonde*:

Similarly in the month of Rajab, in some places *pooriyan*¹ for *koonde* are made in order to transmit the reward to Imam Ja‘far Ṣādiق رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ. This is also permissible but some people insist that they must be eaten in the same place; this is a baseless restriction.”²

He further writes:

Filling *koonde* for Imam Ja‘far Ṣādiق رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ, reciting *Fātiḥa*, etc., and transmitting the reward is permissible. The basis for this action lays in the fact transmitting reward is permissible. Its permissibility is established through hadith and jurisprudence, unless prohibition is established in specific cases. To label it impermissible is to invent a lie against Allah, His Messenger and shari‘ah.³

Mufti Aḥmad Yār Khān Na‘īmi رَحِمَهُ اللهُ عَلَيْهِ explains regarding the *koonde* of Rajab,

On the 22nd of this month within the Indo-Pak Subcontinent, *koonde* takes place. Meaning, new *koonde* (clay basins) are ordered, and *pooriyan* are prepared from flour, sugar and ghee. *Fātiḥa* is then performed for Imam Ja‘far Ṣādiق رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ.”⁴

¹ A deep-fried Indian bread that is traditionally made from wheat flour, water and salt.

² *Bahār-i-Shari‘at*, vol. 3, part 16, p. 643, *Maktaba tul Madina, Karachi*

³ *Fatāwā Amjadiyyah*, vol. 1, part 1, p. 365, *Maktaba tul Madina, Karachi*

⁴ *Islami Zindagi*, p. 76, *Maktaba tul Madina, Karachi*

He further mentions, “The practice of *koonde* on the 22nd of Rajab is good and full of blessings. However, you must do away with the restriction that the food upon which Fātiḥa is recited cannot be taken outside, and that a particular story of a carpenter must be narrated.⁵

This *khatm* cannot be deemed forbidden if Amīr Mu‘āwiyah رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ passed away on the 22nd of Rajab, along with the fact Imam Ja‘far Ṣādiq رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ did not pass away on this day. Firstly, it cannot be said with certainty that the 22nd of Rajab is the day that Amīr Mu‘āwiyah رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ passed away. This is one opinion from many that have been narrated regarding the date of his passing. Historians agree that Amīr Mu‘āwiyah رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ passed away in 60 AH, but there are four opinions regarding the date in the month of the Rajab; 1st, 4th, 15th or the 22nd.

On page 21 of volume 1 of *al-Muḥabbar*, his date of passing is mentioned as the 1st of Rajab. On page 86 *Mashāhir ‘Ulamā al-Amṣār*’s first volume, it is the 15th. On page 226, volume 1 of *Tarikh Khalīfa bin Khayyāṭ*, the 22nd. In volume 5, page 324 of *Tarikh Ṭabari*, all three of the above dates are given. In *Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah*, all four opinions are mentioned.

It is written in *Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah*:

لا خلاف أنه رضى الله عنه، توفي بدمشق في رجب سنة ستين. فقال جماعة: ليلة الخميس للنصف من رجب سنة ستين. وقيل: ليلة
الخميس لثمان بقين من رجب سنة ستين. قاله ابن إسحاق وغير واحد. وقيل: لأربع خلت من رجب. قاله الليث. وقال سعد بن
إبراهيم: ليستهل رجب

There is no disagreement that Amīr Mu‘āwiyah رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ passed away in Damascus, in 60 AH. One group says it was on the night of Thursday the 15th of Rajab 60 AH. Another opinion is that it was a Thursday night on 22th of Rajab 60 AH; this is the view of ibn Ishāq and others. One opinion is the 4th of Rajab, as held by Layth. Sa‘d bin Ibrāhīm said the 1st of Rajab.⁶

Even if we assume that the 22nd of Rajab is the day that Amīr Mu‘āwiyah رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ passed away, it still cannot be deemed to be prohibited to transmit reward to Imam Ja‘far Ṣādiq رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ on this day because of this. This is because the passing away of a pious predecessor on a certain day, cannot be a reason to prohibit transmitting reward to another on the same day. Likewise, Imam Ja‘far Ṣādiq رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ not passing away on this day does not mean that reward cannot be transmitted to him on it, for transmitting reward is unrestrictedly proven from hadith. It is valid whenever it is carried out. Regardless of whether it is the day of his passing or not; this matter is absolutely clear.

Additionally, labelling the *khatm* of *koonde* to be the way of the misguided, deeming it forbidden, and considering its resemblance of the misguided is also false. The reason for this is: the rule in relation to imitating disbelievers and the misguided, is that the person carrying out the action has the intention of resembling them, or that thing is a specific hallmark of

⁵ *Islami Zindagi*, p. 80, Maktaba tul Madina, Karachi

⁶ *Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah*, vol. 11, p. 458, Dār al-Hijr

those misguided people or that thing involves something that is forbidden by the shari‘ah. Besides these cases, there is no reason for its prohibition.

As mentioned in Durr al-Mukhtār and Baḥr al-Rāiq:

والنظم للثاني ”التشبيه بأهل الكتاب لا يكره في كل شيء وإنما نأكل ونشرب كما يفعلون إنما الحرام هو التشبه فيما كان مذمومًا وفيما يقصد به التشبيه كذا ذكره قاضي خان في شرح الجامع الصغير⁷ .“

‘Allāmah Mulla ‘Ali Qāri writes in Minah al-Rawḍ:

أنا ممنوعون من التشبيه بالكفرة وأهل البدعة المنكرة في شعارهم لا ممنهون عن كل بدعة ولو كانت مباحة سواء كانت من أفعال أهل السنة أو من أفعال الكفر وأهل البدعة فالمدار على الشعار⁸.

In any case, it is apparent that there is no intention of imitation nor did the claimant mention this as a reason for its prohibition, and there is no intrinsic dislike according to the shari‘ah in transmitting reward.

Thus remains the matter of whether the *khatm* of *koonde* is a hallmark of the misguided. The response to this is that it is not a specific hallmark of theirs; rather, carrying out the *khatm* of *koonde* on the 22nd of Rajab is the practice of Sunni Muslims in many places. It is necessary upon the one who claims that the *khatm* of *koonde* is a specific practice of the misguided to present proof, as it is not forbidden to imitate every action of the misguided.

In responding to an objection made regarding the impermissibility of hugging after Eid salah on the basis of “the practice of shaking hands after Eid salah being the way of the Rawāfiḍ”, the Imam of Ahl al Sunnah, Imam Aḥmad Razā Khān رَحْمَةُ اللهِ عَلَيْهِ said:

Similarly if the shaking of hands after *fajr* and ‘*aṣr* was invented by the Rawāfiḍ of a particular time and remained a specific sign of theirs, and the scholars of that time considered it disliked for the Ahl al-Sunnah, then why will the hugging after Eid salah be forcibly compared to this? First provide proof that this is something invented by the Rawāfiḍ and a specific hallmark of theirs. Otherwise, a permissible matter will not become impermissible or *makrūh* merely if it is carried out by the misguided. There are countless things that the Ahl al-Sunnah and Rawāfiḍ, in fact the Muslims and disbelievers at large, all take part in. Will they become forbidden for this reason?

Baḥr al-Rāiq, Durr al-Mukhtār, Radd al-Muḥtar and others mention that it is prohibited to imitate the misguided in a matter that in itself is condemned by the shari‘ah, or is a specific sign of that group, or if the one carrying out the action has the intention of resembling them. Otherwise, it is by no means a reason for prohibition.⁹

وَاللَّهُ أَعْلَمُ عَزَّوَجَلَّ وَرَسُولُهُ أَعْلَمَ صَلَّى اللَّهُ تَعَالَى عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ

⁷ Al-Baḥr al-Rāiq, Kitāb al-ṣalāt, vol. 2, p. 11, Dār al-Kitāb al-Islāmi

⁸ Minh al-Rawḍ al-Azhar ‘alā al-fiqh al-akbar, faṣl fī al-kufr ṣariḥan wa kināyah, p. 496, Dār al-Bashāir al-Islāmi

⁹ Al-Fatāwā al-Razawiyah, vol. 8, p. 624, Raza Foundation, Lahore

Written by: *Mufti Muhammad Hashim Khan Attari*

Ref No: *Iar 3879*

Date: *21 Rajab al-Murajjab 1441 AH/17 March 2020 CE*



Dar-ul-Ifta Ahlesunnat (Dawat-e-Islami)



www.daruliftaahlesunnat.net



[daruliftaahlesunnat](https://www.facebook.com/daruliftaahlesunnat)



[DaruliftaAhlesunnat](https://www.youtube.com/DaruliftaAhlesunnat)



[Dar-ul-ifta AhleSunnat](https://play.google.com/store/apps/details?id=com.daruliftaahlesunnat)



feedback@daruliftaahlesunnat.net