Ruling On Rising After The Final Sitting And Performing The Salam In The Standing Position

Darulifta Ahlesunnat

(Dawateislami)

Question

- 1. What do the scholars of Islam say regarding the following matter: If a worshipper rose up forgetfully after the final sitting of salah (qa'dah akhīrah), and upon remembering, he performed the salam in a standing position; will his salah be complete or must he perform a prostration of forgetfulness (sajdah sahw)? If a prostration of forgetfulness is incumbent upon him and he does not perform it, will the repetition of this salah become necessary for him?
- 2. Bahār-i-Sharī'at mentions, "If he performs salam in the standing position, the salah will still be valid, yet he would have left a sunnah."

From this, it seems salah will be correct without a prostration of forgetfulness, as it is not necessary when leaving a sunnah. And likewise, repetition of the salah would not be necessary.

بِسِم اللهِ الرَّحْلُنِ الرَّحِيْمِ الْجَوَابُ بِعَوْنِ الْمَلِكِ الْوَهَّابِ اللهُمَّ هِكَايَةَ الْحَقِّ وَالصَّوَابِ

If a person forgetfully stands after the final sitting of the salah, and upon remembering, performs the concluding salam in a standing position, his *farḍ* will be performed. Yet, repetition of the prayer will be *wājib*. The detail concerning this issue is, after standing up forgetfully following the final sitting, if the Salah performer has not performed the prostration of this additional unit, it is wājib upon him to return (to the seated position and without repeating *tashahhud*), perform a prostration of forgetfulness and conclude with salam.

If the Salah performer does not return and performs salam in a standing position, it will be necessary for him to repeat the salah for omitting the prostration of forgetfulness. The reason a prostration of forgetfulness is necessary here, is due to 'the delaying of a wājib from its place'. It is necessary to perform salam after reciting tashahhud, salat upon the Prophet and a du 'a ma' $th\bar{u}rah$ (any du'a in Quran or hadith), without any interval foreign to the salah.

Standing up after the duʿā is an interval foreign to the salah, so if one stands due to forgetfulness, this makes the prostration of forgetfulness necessary(*Wajib*). If this prostration is not done, the salah is wājib to repeat.

Performing salam seated is a sunnah, so performing it in the standing position is the leaving of a sunnah alongside the abandoning of a wājib.

It is mentioned in Ghunyat al-Mutamallī:1

¹ Ghunyat al-Mutamallī, p. 463, published in Quetta

﴿وان قعدنى آخى الركعة ﴿الرابعة ثم قامى قبل ان يسلم يعود ايضا مالم يسجد ويسلم ليخ وعن الفي ض بالسلام لانه واجب ولايسلم قائما لانه غير مشروع فى الصلوة المطلقة وامكنه الاقامة على وجهه بالعود الى القعدة ويسجد للسهولانه اخرواجها وهوالسلام بسبب فعل زائد لم يلتحق بالصلوة ، بخلاف ما لو اطال الدعاء بعد التشهد لانه يلتحق بها فلا يعد تاخيرا

Returning is wājib and performing salam standing is Makruh (disliked). Imam Ṭaḥṭāwi مَعْنَةُ اللَّهِ عَلَيْهُ says:²

Delaying the salam necessitates a prostration of forgetfulness. It is written in Khizānat al-Muftiyīn:³

Performing salam after the duʿā maˈthūrah without any interval foreign to the prayer is wājib, but this wājib has been left here due to standing up. Ṭawāliʿ al-Anwār says:4

Consequently, just standing up forgetfully after the final sitting makes the prostration of forgetfulness necessary. It is written in Munyah al-Muṣallī:5

If this prostration of forgetfulness is left after it has become necessary, the salah must be repeated. Durr al-Mukhtār says:⁶

Performance of the salam in a standing position is also the leaving of a sunnah. In Imdād al-Fattāh:⁷

2. There is no conflict between the ruling in this fatwa and what is stated in Bahār-i-Sharī^cat. This is because in the latter, the ruling of performing the prostration of forgetfulness is also cited alongside the statement of it being the abandoning of a sunnah. To understand this further, first take note of the complete legal case mentioned in Bahār-i-Sharī^cat:

If one has performed the final sitting to the length of tashahhud and stands up, he should return, perform a prostration of forgetfulness and conclude with salam, as long as he has not performed the prostration of this (extra) unit. If he performs salam in the standing position, the salah will still be valid, but he will have left a sunnah.

² Ḥāshiyat al- Ṭaḥṭāwī alā Al-Durr al-Mukhtār, vol. 1, p. 314, published in Quetta

³ Khizānat al-Muftiyīn, p. 58

⁴ Ṭawāli ʿal-Anwār, vol. 2, part 2, p. 378

⁵ Munyat al-Muṣallī, p. 165, published in Multan

⁶ Al-Durr al-Mukhtār ma'a Radd al-Muḥtār, vol. 2, p. 181, published in Peshawar

⁷ Imdād al-Fattāḥ, p. 519, published in Quetta

In the first part of this legal case, the ruling of the prostration of forgetfulness is clearly explained. The words, "If he performs salam in a standing position, the salah will still be valid", means the fard will be performed, but this does not negate the salah being deficient (thus necessitating prostration of forgetfulness and repetition).

The words, "he will have left a sunnah", further highlight an action which opposes the sunnah. Additionally, the source of this legal ruling is Durr al-Mukhtār and Radd al-Muḥtār, and the deficiency in the salah despite the farḍ being performed, has been clearly mentioned therein.

In Durr al-Mukhtār:

8ء كَوْمَةُ اللَّهِ عَلَيْهِ Below this, Allamah Ibn 'Ābidīn Shāmī رَحْمَةُ اللَّهِ عَلَيْهِ said:8

Removal of a confusion

If it were to be accepted that performing salam whilst standing is merely in opposition to the sunnah and does not necessitate a prostration of forgetfulness and repetition of the prayer, this would necessitate conflict within the legal case in Bahār-e-Sharī'at. This is because in the very beginning of this legal case, the ruling of returning, performing a prostration of forgetfulness and concluding with salam has been explained.

If performing the salam standing was only in opposition to the sunnah, then why is a prostration of forgetfulness wājib upon performing this salam seated? The omission of a sunnah does not make a prostration of forgetfulness necessary. The reality is, performing the salam standing is not only in opposition to the sunnah, it is also the abandoning of a wājib. This leaves no conflict within the legal case.

وَ اللَّهُ أَعْلَمُ عَزَّوَجَلَّ وَ رَسُولُ لَا أَعْلَم صَلَّى اللهُ تَعَالَى عَلَيْهِ وَالِهِ وَسَلَّم

Answered By: Mufti Muhammad Qasim Attari

Ref No: *PIN-7034*

Date: 8 Şafar al-Muzaffar 1444 AH/ 5th September 2022



⁸ Radd al-Muḥtār ma'a al-Durr al-Mukhtār , vol. 2, p. 667, published in Peshawar