How Is It for a Woman to Offer Salah in a Cape Shawl? Darulifta Ahlesunnat

(Dawateislami)

Question

What do the noble scholars and jurists of Islamic law say about the following: Some women use cape shawls instead of sweaters to protect themselves from the cold. They come in various designs. Some have sleeves to insert their arms, while others don't. They are placed over the shoulders and fastened by a hook or a snap fastener in the front. My question is, what is the ruling about offering Salah wearing these shawls without fastening them from the front?



Before addressing the question, it should be known that some acts, such as talking and walking, cause the Salah to become nullified. Meanwhile, some cause the Salah to become Makruh Tahrimi. One of those acts is 'Sadl'. The Hadith prohibits Sadl. The Jurist explain some different situations for it. One case they mention is 'not wearing a piece of clothing how it should be worn, rather hanging it over the body' such as placing a jacket or waistcoat over the shoulders and not inserting the arms in the sleeves. Another explanation of 'Sadl' is 'those clothing which don't have sleeves, placing them over the shoulder without binding it from the front' such as shawls. Sadl causes the Salah to become Makruh Tahrimi and Wajib-Ul-I'adah. The rulings for both cape shawls are mentioned below as per the details mentioned above:

- (1) To place such cape shawls that have sleeves over the shoulders, without inserting the arms in them will be considered Sadl. To offer Salah in this state is Makruh Tahrimi and a sin. If offered in this state, it must be repeated. However, if the arms are inserted in the sleeves, it will not be Sadl, and the Salah will be valid. It is not necessary to fasten it from the front via a button. This is the ruling for a waistcoat.
- (2) As for the cape shawls which don't have sleeves and are worn over the shoulders, placing them over the shoulder without

fastening the front with a button or hook will count as Sadl and become Makruh Tahrimi. However, if both ends are fastened via a button etc. this will not count as Sadl, and the Salah will become valid.

The prohibition of Sadl has been mentioned in the Hadith. It is narrated in *Sunan Al-Tirmizi* from Abu Hurairah رضی الله تعالی عنه:

(Jami' Al-Tirmizi, Chapters of Salah, Chapter of what came about the aversion of Sadl, Vol. 1, p. 488, Publ. Beirut)

Allama Mulla Ali Qari رحبةالله states while mentioning the details of Sadl:

وفي الفائق: السدل إرسال الثوب من غير أن يضم جانبيه، -- في شرح المنية: السدل أن يضع الثوب على كتفه ويرسل أطرافه على عضديه أو صدره، وقيل: أن يجعله على رأسه أو كتفه ويرسل أطرافه من جوانبه، وفي فتاوى قاضي خان: هو أن يجعل الثوب على رأسه أو على عاتقه ويرسل جانبيه أمامه على صدره والكل سدل - وحكمته والله أعلم اشتغال القلب، بمحافظته والاحتياج بمعالحته

(Mirqat Al-Mafatih, Vol. 2, p. 635-636, Publ. Beirut)

The Imam of Ahl Al-Sunnah, A'lā Hazrat Imām Aḥmad Razā Khān عَلَيْهِ الرَّّحْمَة writes:

اصل یہ ہے کہ سدل یعنی پہننے کے کپڑے کو بے پہنے لٹکانا، مکروہ تحریمی ہے اور اس سے نماز واجب الاعادہ جیسے انگر کھایا کر تاکند ھوں پر سے ڈال لینا بغیر آستینوں میں ہاتھ ڈالے یا بعض بارا نیاں وغیر ہ الیی بنتی ہیں کہ اُن کی آستینوں میں مونڈ ھوں کے پاس ہاتھ نکال لینے کے چاک ہے ہوتے ہیں ان میں سے ہاتھ نکال کر آستینوں کو بے پہنے چھوڑ دینا یار ضائی یاچا در کندھے یاسر پر ڈال کر دونوں آنچل چھوڑ دینا یاشال یار ومال ایک شانہ پر اس طرح ڈالنا کہ اس کے دونوں بلو آگے پیچے چھوٹے رہیں۔

Translation: The rule is that Sadl i.e. hanging the garments that should be worn, is Makruh Tahrimi and causes the Salah to become Wajib-ul-I'adah. Such as placing the robe or shirt over the shoulders without inserting the arms in the sleeves. Some raincoats are made such that their sleeves have a slit next to the neck to insert the arms in. Inserting the arms in those slits and leaving the sleeves, placing a

quilt over both shoulders or the heads leaving the ends hanging, or hanging the shawls, etc. over one shoulder in such a way that either side is in front and back.(Fatāwā Razawiyyaĥ, Vol. 7, p. 385, Publ. Raza Foundation, Lahore)

Placing the Shawl over the shoulders and hanging in front without joining both ends is Sadl. However, if they are joined, it will not be Sadl. It is stated in *Al-Binayah Sharah Hidayah*:

(Al-Binayah Sharah Hidaya, Vol. 4, p. 272, Publ. Beirut)

It is stated in another place in *Al-Binayah*:

(Al-Binayah Sharah Hidayah, Vol. 4, p. 446, Publ. Beirut)

If jackets, waistcoats, and anything of its type are placed over the shoulder without inserting the arms in the sleeves, only then it will be Sadl. Both situations have been stated in *Al-Lubab Fi Sharh Al-Kitab*, *Sharah Wiqayah*, and other books of Fiqh as follows (the following words from *Al-Lubab*):

(Al-Lubab Fi Sharah Al-Kitab, Vol. 1, p. 83, Publ. Beirut)

Inserting the arms in the sleeves of the waistcoat is sufficient to avoid Sadl. It isn't necessary to fasten it in front. Imam of Ahl Al-Sunnah رحمة الله عليه states in this regard:

Translation: The 'Angrakha' and 'Chugga'¹ which are worn over a 'Sadri' and generally aren't fastened, if it isn't considered dishonorable, then there should be no issue with it either. (Fatāwā Razawiyyaĥ, Vol. 7, p. 386, Publ. Raza Foundation, Lahore)

It is stated in *Fatawa Fageeh-e-Millat*:

¹ Angrakha, Chugga, and Sadri all are different types of outerwear.

اس طرح کیڑا پہن کر نماز پڑھی کہ نیچے کرتے کاسارا بٹن بندہے اور اُوپر شیر وانی یاصَدری کا کل یابعض بٹن کھلاہے ، تو حرج نہیں۔

Translation: If Salah is offered while one's clothing is buttoned up, but all or some of the buttons on the 'Sherwani' or 'Sadri' worn on top are opened, there is no issue. (Fatawa Faqeeh-e-Millat, Vol. 1, p. 174, Publ. Shabir Brothers, Lahore)

وَاللَّهُ أَعْلَمُ عَزَّو جَلَّ وَرَسُولُه أَعْلَم صَلَّى اللهُ تَعَالَى عَلَيْهِ وَالِهِ وَسَلَّم

(Allah Almighty knows best and His Messenger صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَ الِهِ وَسَلَّم knows best.)

Answered By: Abu Turab, Muhammad Ali Attari Verified By: Mufti Muhammad Qasim Attari

Ref No: Pin-7368

Date: 7th Jumad Al-Ukhra 1445 AH/21st December 2023

