Can a Fard Salāh be Offered With One Offering a Nafl Salāh? Clarification of a Ḥadīth

Darulifta Ahlesunnat (Dawateislami)

(Translated Fatwa)

Question

What do the noble scholars and jurists of Islamic law say about the following: Can a person offering a fard salāh follow an imām who is offering a nafl salāh? I read a ḥadīth that Muʿādh bin Jabal رضی اللہ عنہ would offer salāh with the Prophet ﷺ, then he would go and lead his people in the same salāh. This seems to prove that a fard salāh can be offered behind someone who is offering a nafl salāh.
Furthermore, I heard someone on social media say that only the Ḥanafīs consider it impermissible, whereas all the other Imams, along with others, hold the position that it is permissible. Are all these points true? I would like a written answer supported with substantial evidence.

Answer

بِسْمِ اللّٰہِ الرَّحْمٰنِ الرَّحِیْمِ

اَلْجَوَابُ بِعَوْنِ الْمَلِکِ الْوَھَّابِ اَللّٰھُمَّ ھِدَایَۃَ الْحَقِّ وَالصَّوَابِ

According to the blessed aḥādīth, a person offering a fard salāh cannot offer his salāh in congregation behind someone who is offering a nafl salāh.
The details of this ruling are as follows: It has been mentioned in a ḥadīth that an imām is liable for his followers (muqtadīs), meaning that an imām's salāh contains the salāh of his muqtadīs. Based on this, the jurists have established that the salāh of the imām and muqtadī must be the same for the congregational salāh to be valid. This means that it should be possible for the muqtadī to join the imām in salāh with the same intention as the imām, so that the imām's salāh can contain the muqtadī's salāh. This is only possible if the imām's salāh is of a higher rank or at least equal to the muqtadī's salāh, because for something to contain another, the former must be greater or at least equal to that which it contains. It is a clear fact that the rank of a nafl is less than a fard. Therefore, if one offers a fard salāh in congregation with someone who is offering a nafl, the imām's salāh will not contain the muqtadī's salāh because the rank of the imām's nafl salāh is less than the rank of the muqtadī's fard salāh. In such a case, the salāh of the muqtadī will not be valid.
Another proof of this is that the ḥadīth instructs one to obey the imām, and opposing the imām has been prohibited. Moreover, the intention is an important pillar of the salāh. Therefore, if one offers a salāh with the intention of fard in congregation with someone who is offering a nafl, he is opposing the imām with regards to a major pillar by intending a salāh that is greater than the imām's salāh. Hence, in this case, the salāh is invalid because obedience to the imām was not observed.

Furthermore, this is not merely the position of the Ḥanafī school of thought; this is also the position of Imām Mālik Bin Anas and numerous Tābiʿīs of Madīnah and Kūfah رحمة الله تعالى عليه. According to one narration, Imām Aḥmad Bin Ḥanbal رحمة الله تعالى عليه also held this view. This will be mentioned in detail below.

Explanation of Muʿādh Bin Jabal's رضي الله تعالى عنه narration:

(1) It is clear from the narration of Muʿādh Bin Jabal رضي الله تعالى عنه that he would offer nafl in congregation with the Prophet ﷺ so that he could learn the proper method of salāh and attain the blessings of praying behind him. Then, he would go and lead his people in the fard salāh. In this way, he would earn the reward of offering salāh with the Prophet ﷺ and leading his people in salāh. There is consensus that this method is permissible. Therefore, the practice of Muʿādh Bin Jabal will be interpreted to be according to this unanimously agreed upon scenario.

(2) This was the personal practice of Muʿādh Bin Jabal رضي الله تعالى عنه and the Prophet ﷺ did not say anything regarding this. This is why, when the Prophet ﷺ came to know about this, he prohibited Muʿādh Bin Jabal رضي الله تعالى عنه from doing this. Thus, He said: "O Muʿādh, either offer salāh with us or lead your people in an easy salāh." In other words, only do one of the following: either offer salāh in congregation with us and do not lead your people in salāh. If, however, you want to lead your people in salāh, then lead them in an easy salāh and do not offer salāh with us.

(3) For argument's sake, if we accept that Muʿādh Bin Jabal رضي الله تعالى عنه did this because Prophet ﷺ instructed him, then the answer would be that this was at a time when repeating a fard salāh was not prohibited. But later, when repeating a fard salāh was prohibited, then this permission was also abrogated. This prohibition has been narrated in *Sunan Dāraqutnī* and other books of ḥadīth. Once the Prophet ﷺ explicitly prohibited this, the action of no individual can serve as evidence.

Proof and Text Excerpts:

It is narrated in *Sunan Abī Dawūd*, *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*, *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, and other books of ḥadīth (cited from the first):

عن أبي هريرة قال: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم: الإمام ضامن والمؤذن مؤتمن. اللهم أرشد الأئمة واغفر للمؤذنين

Translation: It is narrated that Abū Hurairah رضي الله تعالى عنه said: The Messenger of Allāh ﷺ stated: The imām is responsible and the muʾazzin is entrusted. O Allāh! Guide the imams and forgive the muʾazzins.

(Sunan Abī Dawūd, Vol. 01, p. 389, Publ. Dār al-Risālah al-ʿĀlamiyah)

ʿAllāmah Maḥmūd Bin Aḥmad Ḥanafī Badruddin ʿAynī رحمة الله تعالى عليه (d. 855 AH) states in the commentary of this ḥadīth:

معناه يتضمن صلاته صلاة القوم، وعن هذا قالوا: اقتداء المفترض بالمتنفل لا يجوز؛ لأن تضمين الشيء فيما هو فوقه يجوز وفيما دونه لا يجوز، وهو المعني من الفرق؛ فإن الفرض يشتمل على أصل الصلاة والصفة والنفل يشتمل على أصل الصلاة وإذا كان الإمام مفترضا فصلاته تشتمل صلاة المتقدي وزيادة فيصح الاقتداء وإذا كان متنفلا فصلاته لا تشتمل على ما تشتمل عليه صلاة المقتدين؛ فلا يصح اقتداؤه به؛ لأنه بناء القوي على الضعيف؛ فيكون منفردا في حق الوصف. وهذا الحديث أصل لثلاثة من الفروع تستفاد منه؛ الأول: فساد اقتداء المفترض بالمتنفل

Translation: This means that the imām's salāh contains the salāh of the people. For this reason, the jurists have stated that it is not permissible for someone who is offering a fard to pray in congregation with someone who is offering a nafl. This is because something can be contained within something of a higher rank, but it cannot be contained within something of a lower rank. This is the point of difference because the fard salāh consists of the essence of salāh as well as an (additional) attribute of salāh (being fard) whereas nafl only consists of the essence of salāh. Hence, when the imām is offering a fard salāh, his salāh includes the salāh of the muqtādī (who is offering nafl) along with some excess, which is why the iqtidāʾ is valid. But when the imām is offering nafl, his salāh is not inclusive of what the muqtadīs are offering (i.e., the fard salāh), so following him is not valid. This is because, in this case, the stronger is based upon the weaker, and, with regard to this (additional) attribute, he will be considered to be alone. This ḥadīth is the basis for three rulings that are derived from it. The first ruling is that it is not valid for someone who is offering a fard to pray behind someone who is offering a nafl. (Sharḥ Sunan Abī Dāwūd Lil-ʿAynī, Vol. 02, p. 368, Publ. Maktabah al-Rushd, Riyadh)

It is stated in *Mirʾāt al-Manājīḥ*:

امام مقتدیوں کی نماز کا ذمہ دار ہے، اور اپنی نماز کے ضمن میں ان کی نمازوں کو لیے ہوئے، اسی لئے امام کی قرأت مقتدی کی قرأت ہے، امام کے سہو سے مقتدی پر سجدہ سہو ہے۔۔۔ اس سے معلوم ہوا کہ نفل والے کے پیچھے فرض والے کی نماز جائز نہیں کیونکہ فرض نفل سے اعلیٰ ہے؛ اور اعلیٰ کے ضمن میں ادنیٰ آسکتا ہے، نہ کہ ادنیٰ کے ضمن میں اعلیٰ۔ یونہی اگر مقتدی کی نماز امام کی نماز سے مختلف ہو تو جائز نہیں، کیونکہ کوئی نماز اپنے غیر کو اپنے ضمن میں نہیں لے سکتی۔ غرض کہ یہ حدیث بہت سے مسائل میں امام اعظم کی دلیل ہے۔

Translation: The imām is responsible for the muqtadīs' salāh and his salāh consists of their salāh as well. This is why the qirāʾah of the imām is considered the qirāʾah of the muqtadī, sajdah al-sahw becomes necessary on the muqtadī due to the imām's mistake… This shows that it is not permissible for someone who is offering a fard to pray behind someone who is offering a nafl because a fard is of a higher rank than a nafl, and the higher can include the lower but the lower cannot include the higher. Similarly, if the muqtadīs' salāh is different from the imām's salāh, this is not permissible because one salāh cannot include an entirely different salāh. In conclusion, this ḥadīth is evidence for many of Imām Aʿzam's rulings. (Mirʾāt al-Manājīḥ, Vol. 01, p. 401, Publ. Qādrī Publishers)

It is narrated in *Saḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, *Saḥīḥ Muslim*, *Sunan Abī Dāwūd*, etc:

عن أنس بن مالك قال وقال: إنما جعل الإمام ليؤتم به، فإذا كبر فكبروا، وإذا ركع فاركعوا، وإذا رفع فارفعوا، وإذا قال: سمع الله لمن حمده، فقولوا: اللهم ربنا ولك الحمد

Translation: It is narrated that Anas Bin Mālik رضي الله تعالى عنه said that the Messenger of Allāh ﷺ stated: "An imām is appointed so he may be followed. Hence, when he says takbīr, say the takbīr. When he performs rukūʿ, perform rukūʿ. When he rises, then rise. When he says سمع الله لمن حمده, say اللهم ربنا ولك الحمد." (Saḥīḥ al-Bukhārī, Vol. 03, p. 50, Publ. India)

Al-Tamhīd Li-Ibn ʿAbdul Barr states:

فقال مالك وأصحابه لا يجزي أحدا أن يصلي صلاة الفريضة خلف المتنفل۔۔۔ وحجتهم أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم **قال إنما جعل**

الإمام ليؤتم به فمن خالفه في نيته فلم يأتم به **وقال فلا تختلفوا عليه** ولا اختلاف أشد من اختلاف النيات إذ هي ركن العمل

Translation: Imām Mālik and his companions state that it is not valid for anyone to offer a fard salāh behind someone who is offering a nafl salāh… Their evidence is that the Prophet ﷺ said: "An imām is appointed so he may be followed." Thus, the one who differs from him in intention has not followed him. He ﷺ has also stated: "Do not contradict the imām." There is no greater contradiction than the contradiction in intention, for intention is the pillar of an action. (Al-Tamhīd Li-Ibn ʿAbdul Barr, Vol. 24, p. 367, Publ. Wizārah ʿUmūm Awqāf)

Mentioning one of the conditions for iqtidāʾ (following the imām), ʿAllāmah ʿAlāuddīn Ḥaskafī رحمة الله تعالى عليه writes:

واتحاد صلاتهما

Translation: There should be unity in their salāh (of the muqtadī and the imām). Under this, ʿAllāmah Shāmī رحمة الله تعالى عليه writes in *Radd al-Muḥtār*:

قال في البحر: والاتحاد أن يمكنه الدخول في صلاته بنية صلاة الامام فتكون صلاة الامام متضمنة لصلاة المقتدي اهـ فدخل اقتداء المتنفل بالمفترض

Translation: Unity (in the salāh) means that it should be possible for the muqtadī to enter his salāh within the imām's salāh with the intention of the imām's salāh, such that the imām's salāh includes the salāh of the muqtadī. End quote. Thus, this included the iqtidāʾ of the one offering a nafl with the one offering fard." (Al-Durr al-Mukhtār Maʿa Radd al-Muḥtār, Vol. 02, p. 338-339, Publ. Dār al-Maʿrifah, Beirut)

It is not valid for the one offering a fard to follow one offering a nafl, nor for the one offering one type of fard to follow one offering another type of fard. Thus, it is stated in *Tanwīr al-Absār Maʿa al-Durr al-Mukhtār*:

(و) لا (مفترض بمتنفل وبمفترض فرضا آخر) لأن اتحاد الصلاتين شرط عندنا

Translation: It is not valid for the one offering a fard to offer salāh with the one offering a nafl and the one offering one type of fard to offer salāh with the one offering another type of fard, because, according to us, unity in both salāh is a condition. (Tanwīr al-Absār Maʿa Al-Durr al-Mukhtār, Vol. 02, p. 391-392, Publ. Dār al-Maʿrifah, Beirut)

It is stated in *Bahār-E-Sharīʿat*:

فرض نماز نفل پڑھنے والے کے پیچھے اور ایک فرض والے کی دوسرے فرض پڑھنے والے کے پیچھے نہیں ہو سکتی؛ خواہ دونوں کے فرض دو نام کے ہوں، مثلاً ایک ظہر پڑھتا ہو دوسرا عصر یا صفت میں جُدا ہوں، مثلاً ایک آج کی ظہر پڑھتا ہو، دوسرا کل کی۔

Translation: It is not valid for one offering a fard to pray behind the one offering a nafl and for the one offering one type of fard to pray behind the one offering another type of fard, regardless of whether they differ in name (such as one is offering Dhuhr and another is offering ʿAsr) or they differ in description, (such as one is offering today's Dhuhr and the other is offering yesterday's Dhuhr). (Bahār-e-Sharīʿat, Vol. 01, pt. 03, p. 572, Publ. Maktaba-Tul-Madīnah, Karachī)

Imām Mālik also held this view, as stated in *Al-Maʿūnah ʿAlā Madhhab*, *ʿUyūn al-Masāʾil*, and *al-Tafrīʿ* (cited from the former):

فإن كان الإمام متنفلًا لم يجز أن يصلي خلفه مفترض

Translation: If the imām is offering a nafl salāh, it is not permissible for one to offer fard salāh behind him.
(Al-Maʿūnah ʿAlā Madhhab ʿĀlim al-Madīnah, Vol. 01, p. 252, Publ. Al-Maktaba al-Tijāriyah, Mecca)
It is stated in *ʿUyūn al-Masāʾil*:

قال مالك: لا يأتم مفترض بمتنفل، وبه قال أبو حنيفة

Translation: Imām Mālik said: The one who is offering a fard salāh should not offer salāh behind the one who is offering a nafl salāh. Imām Abū Ḥanīfah also states this. (ʿUyūn al-Masāʾil Lil-Qādī ʿAbdil-Wahhāb, p. 136, Publ. Dār Ibn Ḥazm, Beirut)
This is the position of Sufyān al-Thawrī and numerous Tābiʿīs of Madīnah and Kūfah, as stated in *Al-Istidhkār* and *al-Tamhīd Li-Ibn ʿAbdul Barr* (cited from the latter):

أو يكون الإمام في نافلة والمأموم في فريضة وهذا موضع اختلف الفقهاء فيه فقال مالك وأصحابه لا يجزي أحدا أن يصلي صلاة الفريضة خلف المتنفل ولا يصلي عصرا خلف من صلى ظهرا وهو قول أبي حنيفة وأصحابه والثوري وقول جمهور التابعين بالمدينة والكوفة وحجتهم أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم قال إنما جعل الإمام ليؤتم به فمن خالفه في نيته فلم يأتم به وقال فلا تختلفوا عليه ولا اختلاف أشد من اختلاف النيات إذ هي ركن العمل

Translation: Or if the imām is offering nafl and the muqtadī is offering a fard. This issue is subject to juristic difference of opinion. Imām Mālik and his companions mentioned that it is not valid for one to offer a fard salāh behind the one offering a nafl salāh, nor can the one offering ʿAsr offer salāh behind the one offering Dhuhr. This is also the position of Imām Abū Hanīfah and his companions, al-Thawrī, and majority of the Tābiʿī of Madīnah and Kūfah. Their evidence is that the Prophet ﷺ said: "An imām is appointed so he may be followed." Thus, the one who differs from him in intention has not followed him. He ﷺ has also stated: "Do not contradict the imām." There is no greater contradiction than the contradiction in intention, for intention is the pillar of an action. (Al-Tamhīd Li-Ibn ʿAbdul Barr, Vol. 24, p. 367, Publ. Wizārah ʿUmūm Awqāf)
This is also a narration of Imām Aḥmad Bin Ḥanbal رحمة الله تعالى عليه, as mentioned by Imām Yaḥyā Bin Hubayrah رحمة الله تعالى عليه (d. 560 AH) in his book, *Ikhtilāf al-ʾAʾimmah al-ʾUlamāʾ*:

ثم اختلفوا في اقتداء المفترض بالمتنفل. فقال أبو حنيفة ومالك وأحمد: لا يجوز

Translation: The scholars have differed in the ruling of someone offering a fard behind someone offering a nafl. Imām Abū Ḥanīfah, Mālik, and Aḥmad said: It is not permissible. (Ikhtilāf al-ʾAʾimmah al-ʾUlamāʾ Li-Ibn Hubayrah, Vol. 01, p. 143, Publ. Dār al-Kutub al-ʿIlmiyah)
The Ḥadīth of Muʿādh Bin Jabal رضي الله تعالى عنه:
Muʿādh Bin Jabal رضي الله تعالى عنه states:

قال: كان معاذ بن جبل يصلي مع النبي صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم، ثم يرجع فيؤم قومه

Translation: He said: Muʿādh Bin Jabal would offer salāh with the Prophet ﷺ. Then, he would return to his people to lead them in salāh. (Saḥīḥ al-Bukhārī, Vol. 01, p. 379, Publ. Dār al-Kamāl al-Muttaḥidah)
Under this ḥadīth, it is stated in *Sharḥ Maʿānī al-Āsār* and *Mirqāt al-Mafātīḥ* (cited from the later):

وفيه أن النية أمر لا يطلع عليه إلا بإخبار الناوي، فجاز أن معاذا كان يصلي مع النبي صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم بنية النفل ليتعلم منه سنة الصلاة ويتبارك بها، ويدفع عن نفسه تهمة النفاق، ثم يأتي قومه فيصلي بهم الفرض لحيازة الفضيلتين، مع أن تأخير العشاء أفضل على الأصح، والحمل على هذا أولى؛ لأنه المتفق على جوازه

Translation: In this ḥadīth, it should be noted that an intention is something that one cannot know unless the person making the intention informs others. Hence, it is possible that Muʿādh would offer salāh with the Prophet ﷺ intending it as a nafl to learn the sunnah method of offering salāh from him, to attain barakah, and to protect himself from being accused of hypocrisy. Then he would go to his people and offer fard along with them and attain both excellences. Along with this, delaying the ʿishāʾ salāh is preferred according to the asaḥ (most valid) opinion. Understanding the ḥadīth through this interpretation is better because this possibility is unanimously agreed upon. (Mirqāt al-Mafātīḥ, Vol. 02, p. 690, Publ. Dār al-Kutub al-ʿIlmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon)

It is stated in *Mirʾāt Manājīḥ*:

ظاہر یہ ہے کہ حضرت معاذ حضور صلی اللہ علیہ وسلم کے ساتھ نفل پڑھ لیتے تھے، پھر اپنی قوم میں آکر انہیں فرض پڑھاتے تھے۔ کیونکہ اس حدیث میں یہ ذکر نہیں کہ آپ پہلے فرض پڑھتے تھے اور بعد میں نفل۔

Translation: It is clear that Muʿādh would offer nafl with the Prophet ﷺ, then he would go to his people and lead them in fard salāh. This (interpretation) is because the ḥadīth does not mention that he would offer fard before and then nafl after. (Mirʾāt Manājīḥ, Vol. 02, p. 54, Publ. Qādrī Publishers)

This was Muʿādh Bin Jabal's رضي الله تعالى عنه personal practice. When the Prophet ﷺ came to know of this, He prevented him from doing so. It is stated in *Musnad Aḥmad*, *al-Tamhīd Li-Ibn ʿAbdul Barr*, *Al-Muʿjam al-Kabīr Lil-Tabrānī* (cited from the former):

فقال: يا رسول الله، إن معاذ بن جبل يأتينا بعد ما ننام، ونكون في أعمالنا بالنهار، فينادي بالصلاة، فنخرج إليه فيطول علينا، فقال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم: يا معاذ بن جبل، لا تكن فتانا، إما أن تصلي معي، وإما أن تخفف على قومك

Translation: He said: O Messenger of Allāh ﷺ, Muʿādh Bin Jabal comes to us after we fall asleep, while we work during the day. Then Bilāl makes the call to salāh, so we come out for salāh, and this is prolonged. So, The Messenger of Allāh ﷺ said: "O Muʿādh Bin Jabal, do not be the cause of fitnah. Either offer salāh with us, or cause ease for your people." (Musnad Aḥmad Bin Ḥanbal, Vol. 34, p. 307, Publ. Muʾassisah al-Risālah, Beirut)

It is stated in *Sharḥ Ibn Battāl*, *ʿUmdah al-Qārī*, *Nukhab al-Afkār*, *Sharḥ Maʿānī al-Āsār* (cited from the former):

قوله لمعاذ هذا يدل على أنه كان عند رسول الله يفعل أحد الأمرين: إما الصلاة معه، وإما الصلاة مع قومه، ولم يكن يجمعهما؛ لأنه قال: إما أن تصلي معي، ولا تصلي بقومك، وإما أن تخفف بقومك، أي ولا تصلي معي، فثبت بهذا الأثر أنه لم يكن من الرسول لمعاذ في ذلك شيء متقدم

Translation: The Prophet ﷺ saying this to Muʿādh proves that He assumed Muʿādh would do only one of the two. Either he would offer salāh with Him, or he would offer salāh with his people; he would not do both together. This is understood through his (ﷺ) saying: Either offer salāh with me and do not offer salāh with your people, or make things easier for your people and do not offer salāh with me. Thus, this narration proves that the Prophet ﷺ had not previously given Muʿādh any

instruction regarding this matter. (Sharḥ Ibn Battāl, Vol. 02, p. 339, Publ. Maktabah al-Rushd)
It is stated in *Mirʾāt al-Manājīḥ*:

اگر آپ حضور کے پیچھے فرض ہی پڑھتے ہوں اور اپنی قوم کے ساتھ نفل تو یہ آپ کا اجتہادی عمل ہے جس کی حضور کو اطلاع نہیں دی گئی تھی۔ اطلاع ہونے پر حضور نے اس سے منع فرما دیا۔

Translation: If, in reality, he would offer fard with the Prophet ﷺ and offer nafl with his people, then this action was according to his ijtihad, and the Prophet ﷺ was not informed of this. But when the Prophet ﷺ came to know of this, he prohibited him from doing so. (Mirʾāt Manājīḥ, Vol. 02, p. 54, Publ. Qādrī Publishers)
Even if Muʿādh Bin Jabal رضي الله تعالى عنه did this with the permission of the Prophet ﷺ, then this was at the time when repeating a fard had not been prohibited. Thus, *Sharḥ Maʿānī al-Āsār* states:

ولو كان في ذلك من رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم أمر, كما قال أهل المقالة الأولى لاحتمل أن يكون ذلك كان من رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم في وقت ما كانت الفريضة تصلى مرتين، فإن ذلك قد كان يفعل في أول الإسلام حتى نهى عنه رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم---. ففعل معاذ الذي ذكرنا يحتمل أن يكون قبل النهي عن ذلك، ثم كان النهي فنسخه

Translation: Even if the Prophet ﷺ had given him any instruction in this regard (as stated by those who hold the first view), it is possible that He ﷺ instructed him at a time when the fard would be offered twice, as this was practiced in the early days of Islām. The Messenger of Allāh ﷺ then prohibited this... It is possible that the practice of Muʿādh occurred before the prohibition; then the prohibition came and abrogated it. (Sharḥ Maʿānī al-Āsār, Vol. 01, p. 409, Publ. ʿĀlam al-Kutub, Beirut)
It is narrated in *Sunan Dāraqutnī*:

قال: أتيت على ابن عمر ذات يوم وهو جالس بالبلاط والناس في صلاة العصر فقلت: أبا عبد الرحمن الناس في الصلاة؟ قال: إني قد صليت, إني سمعت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم يقول: لا تصلى صلاة مكتوبة في يوم مرتين

Translation: Sulaimān, the slave of Maimūnah, said: I went to Abdullah Bin ʿUmar رضي الله تعالى عنه one day while he was sitting on the ground and the people were offering ʿAsr salāh. I said: "O Abū ʿAbdul Raḥmān, the people are offering salāh." He said, I have already offered salāh. I heard the Messenger of Allāh ﷺ say: A fard salāh shall not be offered twice on the same day.(Sunan Dāraqutnī, Vol. 02, p. 275, Publ. Muʾassisah al-Risālah, Beirut)
It is stated in *Mirʾāt al-Manājīḥ*:

اور اگر آپ حضور صلی اللہ علیہ وسلم کے ساتھ فرض ہی پڑھتے ہوں تو اپنی قوم کیساتھ بھی فرض ہی پڑھتے تھے اور یہ اس زمانے کا واقعہ ہے جب ایک فرض دوبار پڑھے جاتے تھے، بعد میں یہ حکم منسوخ ہوگیا۔ چنانچہ حضرت ابن عمر فرماتے ہیں کہ ہم کو ایک فرض دوبار پڑھنے سے منع کیا گیا۔

Translation: If he was offering fard with the Prophet ﷺ, then he would also offer fard with his people; this occurred at a time when a fard was offered twice. This ruling was later abrogated. Thus, Ibn ʿUmar رضي الله تعالى عنه states that we were prohibited from offering the same fard twice. (Mirʾāt Manājīḥ, Vol. 02, p. 54, Publ. Qādrī Publishers)

وَاللّٰہُ اَعْلَمُ عَزَّوَجَلَّ وَرَسُوْلُہ اَعْلَم صَلَّی اللّٰہُ تَعَالٰی عَلَیْہِ وَاٰلِہٖ وَسَلَّم

(Allah Almighty knows best and His Messenger صَلَّی اللّٰہُ عَلَیْہِ وَاٰلِہٖ وَسَلَّم knows best.)

Answered By: Mufti Abū al-Ḥasan Muhammad Hashim Khān Attari

Ref No: JTL-2728
Date: 23rd Ramadān al-Mubārak 1447 AH/ 13th March 2026



Dar-ul-IftaAhlesunnat (Dawat-e-Islami)


www.fatwaqa.com


daruliftaahlesunnat


DaruliftaAhlesunnat


Dar-ul-ifta AhleSunnat


feedback@daruliftaahlesunnat.net